

**In Memoriam:**  
**C. Bartlett McGuire (1925–2006)**  
**Christopher B. Winsten (1923–2005)**

David Boyce  
Professor of Civil and Environmental Engineering  
Northwestern University  
Evanston, Illinois 60208, d-boyce@northwestern.edu

Anna Nagurney  
John F. Smith Memorial Professor  
Department of Finance and Operations Management  
Isenberg School of Management  
University of Massachusetts  
Amherst, Massachusetts 01003, nagurney@gbfin.umass.edu

January 2006

Fifty years after the publication of the classic book *Studies in the Economics of Transportation* by Beckmann, McGuire, and Winsten, we are mourning the deaths of two of its authors, C. Bartlett “Bart” McGuire, on January 23, 2006 in Richmond, California and Christopher “Chris” Blake Winsten, May 28, 2005 in Chelmsford, England. That their seminal contributions to transportation science have continued to stimulate our field for over half a century, and now influence fields not even in existence at that time, speaks to the achievement of this incredible book as well as its scientific collaborators. The sad news of both deaths came to our personal computers via email, a mode of scientific communication possibly unimaginable fifty years ago; yet their contributions remain fresh and pertinent. Bart McGuire and Martin Beckmann, together with their wives, were present on November 15, 2005 at special sessions organized by us at the INFORMS Annual Meeting in San Francisco, California, where many of us had the privilege of meeting Bart McGuire for the first time.

This story really begins at the Cowles Commission for Research in Economics in 1951, which was then based at the University of Chicago. Under the directorship of Tjalling C. Koopmans, who later received the Nobel Memorial Prize in Economic Sciences in 1975,

Martin Beckmann, Bartlett McGuire, and Christopher Winsten began the research that resulted in *Part I of Studies in the Economics of Transportation* (hereafter referred to as BMW). They succeeded to formulate and extensively analyze a nonlinear optimization problem whose optimality conditions correspond to the statement, “Demand refers to trips and capacity refers to flows on roads. The connecting link is found in the distribution of trips over the network according to the principle that traffic follows shortest routes in terms of average cost. The idea of equilibrium in a network can then be described as follows:... the existing traffic conditions are such to call forth the demand that will sustain the flows that create these conditions.” (Beckmann, McGuire and Winsten 1955, p. 3.2; 1956, p. 59) This was an enormous advance in the rigorous modeling of road network traffic, a completely novel result for urban traffic, and most likely for any complex system involving interactions of human behavior with technology. Moreover, they provided a parallel model and analysis for the case of cost-minimizing (now called *system optimum*) flows in a congested traffic network.

Prior to joining the Cowles Commission, Bart McGuire received his BA in Economics and Political Science from the University of Minnesota in 1949 and his MA in Economics from the University of Chicago in 1952. Chris Winsten was educated at Cambridge University in England. Winsten, a mathematician and economist, had an interest in applying probability concepts to industrial issues, whereas McGuire, an economist, provided a pragmatic and realistic check on the model development, and saw the models description through to publication.

The Cowles Commission Report for the period July 1, 1952-June 30, 1954 noted how Beckmann, Koopmans, McGuire, Winsten and, during parts of the period, Nerlove and Goldman, formed the team working on two facets of resource allocation problems concerning transportation systems: highway traffic and railway operations. The report noted how highway transportation has many features in common with markets and also emphasized how, in the context of the railroad contributions, “thus we enter an area of research, variously called “management science,” “operations research,” or “industrial engineering.”

BMW was the first to provide a rigorous mathematical formulation of the conditions described by the first criterion of Wardrop (1952), which they also stated in concurrent

research, that allowed for the ultimate solution of the traffic network equilibrium problem in the context of certain increasing link cost functions of flows on the links. In particular, in their book, Beckmann, McGuire, and Winsten demonstrated that the optimality conditions in the form of Kuhn-Tucker conditions of an appropriately constructed optimization problem coincided with Wardrop's first principle. Hence, no traveler, acting unilaterally has an incentive to alter his route (assuming rational cost (time)-minimizing behavior) since his travel cost (time) is minimal. Their monograph was published in 1956 by Yale University Press, having been issued earlier as Rand Corporation Report, RM-1488-PR, on May 12, 1955.

Koopman's report emphasized that the comparison of highway and railroad transportation demonstrated how differences in technology between two different systems serving quite similar purposes can lead to entirely different forms of organization. Hence, their collaboration also planted seeds for the subfield in economics known as "industrial organization." In 1972, McGuire edited a volume with Roy Radner, entitled, *Decision and Organization: A Volume in Honor of Jacob Marschak*, who (together with Radner) had been a Research Associate at Cowles while BMW were there.

BMW also proposed "efficiency tolls," such that by "charging everyone a toll equal to his contribution to the total cost of others, road users can be induced to make an efficient use of the available capacity", and considered how tolls could be constructed in the case of a simple network (cf. p. 94; Rand, pp. 4.23-4.24). Congestion pricing through tolls continues today as an area of active research as do many of the topics/problems proposed and studied in BMW, including dynamic transportation networks, algorithms, and stability and sensitivity analysis of network flows.

After leaving Cowles in 1954, Bart McGuire worked until 1961 at the Rand Corporation and then assumed academic positions at the University of California at Berkeley, first at the School of Business Administration and then in the Graduate School of Public Policy (until 1993). During 1993-1994 he served as the Acting Director of the University of California Energy Institute. While at the California Energy Institute, McGuire published several reports on decentralization in electric power grids, a topic that fascinated him, along with its (potential) connections to transportation networks. McGuire also published in *Management*

*Science, Water Resources Research, and Energy and Buildings.*

Chris Winsten was known also for his work in statistics. With S. J. Prais, and while at Cowles, he studied the estimation of trends in the case where “deviations from trends” in a time series are serially correlated. This result became known as Prais-Winsten (1954) regression, a result which is still used by economists today. Winsten had also worked at the Universities of Oxford and London (Imperial College) and in 1968 arrived at the University of Essex to join his former Imperial College colleague, Professor G. A. Barnard, in the Department of Mathematics. At Essex, his specialty was stochastic processes; he served as Dean of Mathematical Studies during 1979–1982. He published in the *European Journal of Operational Research*, *Operations Research*, *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society, Series A* and *Series B*, *Econometrica* and the *Journal of Transport Economics and Policy*.

Fifty years after its publication, BMW is finding applications in disciplines that did not even exist when the book was published, such as computer science in the case of decentralized decision-making and the Internet, games on networks, and bounding the price of anarchy! We expect that there will be continuing cross-fertilization between many fields in which networks play a prominent role, with BMW serving as one of the fundamental references. Indeed, BMW laid the intellectual and economic science foundation for transportation systems analysis, planning, and evaluation for the rest of the 20th century and beyond. Moreover, as the above discussion reveals, the work provided linkages to other application areas and fields. As noted in Boyce, Mahmassani, and Nagurney (2005), the ideas and concepts are fundamental and are unlikely to change in the foreseeable future. In conclusion, we raise again the question posed by Boyce, Mahmassani, and Nagurney (2005): Have we left the next generation a contribution that is as far-reaching and thoughtful as what Beckmann, McGuire, and Winsten have given us?

Through Boyce’s efforts, Rand Report, Rand-RM-1488-PR (BMW 1955), is now available free of charge on the Rand Corporation website as a Rand Classic. For the link to the report, and the PPT presentations at the special INFORMS sessions in San Francisco, November, 2005, as well as a special session at the Regional Science Association Internationals North American Meetings in Philadelphia, November, 2003, see:

<http://supernet.som.umass.edu/classics.htm>

## References

Beckmann M., C. B. McGuire and C. B. Winsten. 1956. *Studies in the Economics of Transportation*. Yale University Press, New Haven, Connecticut; also published as Rand-RM-1488-PR, Rand Corporation, Santa Monica, CA, May 12, 1955.

Boyce D. E., H. S. Mahmassani and A. Nagurney. 2005. A retrospective on Beckmann, McGuire, and Winsten's *Studies in the Economics of Transportation*. *Papers in Regional Science* **84**, 85-103.

Cowles Commission for Research in Economics. 1952-1954. Report for Period July 1, 1952-June 30, 1954; <http://cowles.econ.yale.edu/P/reports/1952-54.htm>

Prais, S.J. and C. B. Winsten. 1954. Trend estimators and serial correlation, Cowles Commission Discussion Paper No. 383, Cowles Commission for Research in Economics, Chicago.

Wardrop J. G. 1952. Some theoretical aspects of road traffic research. *Proceedings of the Institution of Civil Engineers, Part II* **1**, 325-378.